

5.4 RECOMMENDATION FOR INCLUSION IN THE HERITAGE REGISTER, OAKLEIGH MOTEL, 1650 DANDENONG ROAD OAKLEIGH EAST

(TPA/36719:BG:RMK)

Ward : Oakleigh

Responsible Director: Paul Kearsley

Reason for Council Consideration: Strategic Planning

RECOMMENDATION

That the Heritage Council be advised of Council's concerns that inclusion of the Oakleigh Motel at 1650 Dandenong Rd Oakleigh East, in the State Heritage Register should ensure that the site remains capable of being redeveloped to provide an acceptable, well-designed residential outcome that is appropriate to the area whilst respecting the valued heritage aspects of the site.

BACKGROUND

The Oakleigh Motel is the first Motel of its type built in Victoria and it opened in 1957. The site was identified in the Monash Heritage Study and was included within the Heritage Overlay provisions of the Monash Planning Scheme.

[HO23 - see ATTACHMENT 2]

Following pre- application discussions held in mid 2008, an application for planning permit, TPA/36719, was lodged on 23 October 2008 for the redevelopment of the site into 54 dwellings. [see ATTACHMENT 3]

Council was advised on 29 October 2008 that Heritage Victoria had completed an assessment of the cultural heritage significance of the site, and that a recommendation would be made to the Heritage Council to include the site in the State Heritage Register. [Heritage Victoria citation - see ATTACHMENT 4]

Submissions concerning this recommendation may be sent to the Heritage Council for its consideration prior to 30 December 2008.

PROPOSAL AND ANALYSIS

The site has heritage significance. This was recognised by the Monash Heritage Study and is confirmed by Heritage Victoria's advice as well as recent advice from expert heritage consultants.

The impact that this heritage value of the site has on the future development options for the site is a question yet to be resolved.

Planning application TPA/36719 proposes to reuse the existing building fabric of the motel units as the basis for new residential dwellings created under the umbrella of "affordable housing". The plans submitted show some of the motel

units modified with second-storey extensions, new dwellings fronting Princes Highway adjacent to the historic facade of the existing building and the conversion of some existing motel rooms into dwellings, without any increase in floor area.

There is a concern that the nature of the use and the minimal habitation standards provided for some of the units is unacceptable. The application is currently being advertised and a determination must be made prior to 16 January 2009 to comply with the statutory requirements of the Planning and Environment Act.

However, it is fair to say, that the proposed development is probably a practical design solution that addresses the heritage issues if it is considered in isolation only on heritage factors. This view is supported by a heritage consultants report regarding the planning application proposal.

It is considered that the relevant heritage elements could be conserved and that a significantly better residential design outcome could be achieved if a major part of the existing built form on the site was demolished and redeveloped.

Inclusion of the site on the State Heritage Register may create or even reinforce the view that the heritage values of the site take precedence over amenity issues and habitation standards.

CONCLUSION

Council needs to participate in the Heritage Council review of Heritage Victoria's recommendation to include the site in the State Heritage register.

The object of that participation should be to ensure that the site remains capable of being redeveloped to provide an acceptable, well-designed residential outcome appropriate to the area while respecting the valued heritage aspects of the site. Amenity and habitation standards should not be sacrificed to achieve heritage outcomes where acceptable alternatives are available.