

4.4 TENDER FOR TREE PRUNING AND OTHER TREE WORKS

(CF2019136: Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works – LS)

Responsible Director: Ossie Martinz

RECOMMENDATION***PART A****CYCLIC PRUNING PROGRAM (Single Supplier)**

1. Awards the tender from Active Tree Services for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. 2019136, Part A - Annual Cyclic Pruning for the fixed lump sum of \$1,809,630 per annum and an estimated total contract value of \$10,857,780 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option);
2. Authorises the Chief Executive Officer or their delegate to execute the contract agreement and approve extension options subject to satisfactory performance; and
3. Notes that the contract will commence on 1 September 2019 and the completion date is 31 August 2023 (initial 4 year contract term) with one (1) two (2) year extension option.

PART B**TOPIARY & HIGH GRAFT PRUNING (Single Supplier)**

1. Awards the tender from TreeServe Pty Ltd for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. 2019136, Part B – Topiary & High Graft Pruning (Mop Tops) for the fixed Lump Sum of \$42,840 per annum and an estimated total contract value of \$257,040 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option);
2. Authorises the Chief Executive Officer or their delegate to execute the contract agreement and approve extension options subject to satisfactory performance; and
3. Notes that the contract will commence on 12 August 2019 and the completion date is 11 August 2023 (initial 4 year contract term) with one (1) two (2) year extension option.

RECOMMENDATION* (CONTINUED)**PART C1****TREE PRUNING – ELECTRICAL LINE CLEARANCE (Panel)**

1. *Awards the tender from TreeServe Pty Ltd for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. CF2019136, Part C Tree Pruning – Electrical line clearance for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$18,000 and an estimated total contract value of \$108,000 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
2. *Awards the tender from Active Tree Services for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. CF2019136, Part C Tree Pruning – Electrical line clearance for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$44,736 and an estimated total contract value of \$268,416 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
3. *Authorises the Chief Executive Officer or their delegate to execute the contract agreement and approve extension options subject to satisfactory performance; and*
4. *Notes that the contract will commence on 1 September 2019 and the completion date is 31 August 2023 (initial 4 year contract term) with one (1) two (2) year extension option.*

RECOMMENDATION* (CONTINUED)**PART C2****TREE PRUNING – REACTIVE WORKS (Panel)**

1. *Awards the tender from TreeServe Pty Ltd for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. CF2019136, Part C Tree Pruning – Reactive Works for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$295,008 and an estimated total contract value of \$1,770,048 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
2. *Awards the tender from Active Tree Services for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. CF2019136, Part C Tree Pruning – Reactive Works for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$575,637 and an estimated total contract value of \$3,453,822 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
3. *Authorises the Chief Executive Officer or their delegate to execute the contract agreement and approve extension options subject to satisfactory performance; and*
4. *Notes that the contract will commence on 1 September 2019 and the completion date is 31 August 2023 (initial 4 year contract term) with one (1) two (2) year extension option.*

RECOMMENDATION* (CONTINUED)**PART C3****LIVE LINE CLEARANCE (Panel)**

1. *Awards the tender from TreeServe Pty Ltd for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. CF2019136, Part C Tree Pruning – Live Line Clearance for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$155,000 and an estimated total contract value of \$930,000 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
2. *Awards the tender from Active Tree Services for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. CF2019136, Part C Tree Pruning – Live Line Clearance for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$270,080 and an estimated total contract value of \$1,620,000 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
3. *Authorises the Chief Executive Officer or their delegate to execute the contract agreement and approve extension options subject to satisfactory performance; and*
4. *Notes that the contract will commence on 1 September 2019 and the completion date is 31 August 2023 (initial 4 year contract term) with one (1) two (2) year extension option.*

PART C4**TREE REMOVAL (Single Supplier)**

1. *Awards the tender from TreeServe Pty Ltd for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. 2019136, Part C – Tree removal for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$729,770 and an estimated total contract value of \$4,378,620 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
2. *Authorises the Chief Executive Officer or their delegate to execute the contract agreement and approve extension options subject to satisfactory performance; and*
3. *Notes that the contract will commence on 1 September 2019 and the completion date is 31 August 2023 (initial 4 year contract term) with one (1) two (2) year extension option.*

RECOMMENDATION* (CONTINUED)**PART C5****STUMP GRINDING (Panel)**

1. *Awards the tender from TreeServe Pty Ltd for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. 2019136, Part C – Stump Grinding for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$8,662 and an estimated total contract value of \$51,975 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
2. *Awards the tender from Active Tree Services for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. 2019136, Part C – Stump Grinding for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$19,635 and an estimated total contract value of \$117,810 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
3. *Authorises the Director Infrastructure to execute the contract agreement and approve extensions subject to the satisfactory performance; and*
4. *Notes that the contract will commence on 1 September 2019 and the completion date is 31 August 2023 (initial 4 year contract term) with one (1) two (2) year extension option.*

PART C6**TREE ROOT BARRIERS (Single Supplier)**

1. *Awards the tender from Stumpmasters and Rootcontrollers Australia for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. 2019136, Part C – Tree Root Management for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$7,200 and an estimated total contract value of \$43,200 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
2. *Authorises the Director Infrastructure to execute the contract agreement and approve extension options.*
3. *Notes that the contract will commence on 1 September 2019 and the completion date is 31 August 2023 (initial 4 year contract term) with one (1) two (2) year extension option.*

RECOMMENDATION* (CONTINUED)**PART C7****DATA COLLECTION (Panel)**

1. *Awards the tender from Homewood Consulting Pty Ltd for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. 2019136, Part C – Data Collection for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$500 and an estimated total contract value of \$3,000 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
2. *Awards the tender from Active Tree Services for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. 2019136, Part C – Data Collection for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$825 and an estimated total contract value of \$4,950 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
3. *Authorises the Director Infrastructure to execute the contract agreement and approve extensions options; and*
4. *Notes that the contract will commence on 1 September 2019 and the completion date is 31 August 2023 (initial 4 year contract term) with one (1) two (2) year extension option.*

RECOMMENDATION* (CONTINUED)**PART D****PLANTING & ESTABLISHMENT (Panel)**

1. *Awards the tender from Sevron Pty Ltd for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. 2019136, Part D Tree Planting & Establishment for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$155,770.00 and an estimated total contract value of \$934,620.00 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
2. *Awards the tender from Metropolitan Tree Growers Pty Ltd for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. 2019136, Part D Tree Planting & Establishment for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$163,310.00 and an estimated total contract value of \$979,860.00 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
3. *Awards the tender from CityWide Pty Ltd for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works, Contract No. 2019136, Part D Tree Planting & Establishment for the schedule of rates based contract with an estimated annual expenditure of \$173,340.00 and an estimated total contract value of \$1,040,040.00 inclusive of all available extension options (executable at Council's option); and*
4. *Authorises the Chief Executive Officer to execute the contract agreement and approve extension options subject to satisfactory performance; and*
5. *Notes that the contract will commence on 12 August 2019 and the completion date is 11 August 2023 (initial 4 year contract term) with one (1) two (2) year extension option.*

INTRODUCTION

City of Monash has participated in a collaborative tender for CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Other Tree Works. The participating councils in this collaborative tender include:-

- City of Monash
- City of Banyule
- City of Greater Dandenong
- Manningham City Council
- Moreland City Council
- Nillumbik Shire Council
- City of Whitehorse Council
- Yarra Ranges Shire Council

The participating Councils formally appointed Manningham City Council as the lead agency for this tender.

The Manningham Value for Money evaluation methodology was adopted for this collaborative tender. The Value for Money methodology uses the collaborative qualitative score for each tenderer (out of 100%) and divides this by the tendered price to calculate a Value for Money score. These scores are then ranked to provide best value ranking for the participating Councils.

The tender required tenderers to submit separate prices for each component of work and was packaged to combine like services to maximise contractor management and operational efficiencies into four key parts including:-

PART	ACTIVITY	DESCRIPTION
PART A	Cyclic Pruning Program	Annual cyclic pruning involves the proactive pruning of all street trees to meet the requirements of Council's Electrical Line Clearance Management and Road Management Plans while also monitoring the health and condition of each tree on an annual basis to proactively manage trees that may cause a risk to the public.
PART B	Topiary & High Graft Pruning (Mop Tops)	Topiary trees are pruned to ensure a uniform, healthy and compact spherical shape. Typically, these trees will be located in and around Council's activity centres. The Mop Tops (Robinia) pruned on a bi annual basis to maintain their form and health.
PART C	Overview	Part C covers a range of tree management services that are used on a reactive basis including Emergency situations and as prescribed by Council's team of arborists and where appropriate other authorised officers. Works include: tree pruning, removal and root management of street trees, open space reserve and community facility trees to ensure we maintain and enhance Council's tree populations. All works are required to meet Council's Electrical Line Clearance Management Plan and the Australian Standard for Pruning of Amenity Trees (AS Standard AS4373-2007) and emergency call-outs.
PART C1	Pruning – Electrical Line Clearance	Pruning of vegetation as per Council's Electrical Line Clearance Management Plan.
PART C2	Tree Pruning – Reactive Works	Pruning of Council Trees in accordance with Australian Standard AS4373-2007.
PART C3	Pruning – Live Line Clearance	Pruning of vegetation as per Council's Electrical Line Clearance Management Plan.
PART C4	Tree Removal	Removal of dead, dying and dangerous Council trees.
PART C5	Stump Grinding	The removal and disposal of all stump grindings and tree roots. The reinstatement of area with top soil and seed.
PART C6	Tree Root Barrier	Investigation of root activity. Installation of Tree Root Barriers and Tree Root.
PART C7	Data Collection	Collection and update of Council's Tree Database. Capturing details of each tree asset
PART D	Planting & Establishment	Planting and establishment of Council's street trees. Supporting the implementation of Street Tree Strategy. Establishment of street trees for a duration of two (2) years.

BACKGROUND

Council currently engages the services of Active Tree Services, TreeServe, Stumpmasters & Rootcontrollers Australia and Sevron to deliver our current Tree Pruning contract.

This contract is broken into three parts as detailed below:-

Contract No.	Part	Contract Name	Contractor/s
CF2016156	Part A	Street Tree Pruning and Associated Works PART A: Cyclic Tree Pruning	Active Tree Services
CF2016156	Part B	Street Tree Pruning and Associated Works PART B: Topiary & High Graft Pruning	TreeServe Pty Ltd
CF2016156	Part C	Street Tree Pruning and Associated Works PART C: Panel	TreeServe Pty Ltd, Stumpmasters & Rootcontrollers Australia, Active Tree Services Pty Ltd, Sevron Pty Ltd

This contract CF2016156 expired on 30 June 2019. A short term extension was awarded to TreeServe and Stumpmasters and Rootcontrollers to continue services within Part C – Tree Pruning and Associated Works during the period of the collaborative tender evaluation and reporting to conclude in July 2019.

The CF2019136 Tree Pruning and Associated Works tender addresses all the requirements from CF2016156 to ensure the continued delivery of services required for Council's tree assets across the city.

NOTIFICATION

This collaborative tender was advertised by Manningham (acting as the Monash City Council Agent) on 1 April 2019 and the tender closed on Wednesday 8th May 2019.

TENDERS RECEIVED

Tender submissions for Monash were received from the following by the appointed closing time:-

Tenderer	Part A	Part B	Part C	Part D
Active Tree Services Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	x
Arbor Co	x	x	✓	x
Aspect Tree Management Pty Ltd	x	x	✓	x
Assured Tree Care Pty Ltd	x	x	✓	x
Batt Brothers Vegetation Management	x	x	✓	x
Citywide	x	x	✓	✓
Homewood Consulting Pty Ltd	x	x	✓	x
Metropolitan Tree Growers Pty Ltd	x	x	x	✓
Sevron Pty Ltd	x	✓	✓	✓
Steven's Specialist Tree Service Pty Ltd	x	x	✓	x
Stumpmasters & Rootcontrollers	x	x	✓	x
The Tree Company Arboriculture Services Pty Ltd	x	x	✓	x
TreeServe Pty Ltd	✓	✓	✓	x
VGA	x	x	✓	x

TENDER CONFORMANCE

All submissions received were accessed for their compliance with the tender conditions including the contractual terms and conditions and the requirements of the response schedules. All tender submissions received for City of Monash were deemed conforming. All tenderers were then further evaluated as per the agreed evaluation criteria

TENDER EVALUATION

To support the evaluation process representatives from the evaluation panel met with other participating collaborative Council representatives at Manningham City Council in an advisory role.

All members of the evaluation panel signed Conflict of Interest and Confidentiality forms and no conflicts were raised.

All tenders were assessed in accordance with the evaluation criteria published in the tender documentation.

The Evaluation Process assessed four key areas including:

1. Tendered Price
2. Pass/Fail Assessment Criteria
3. Collaborative Qualitative Score
4. Value for Money Score

The Monash Evaluation panel consisted of:-

Mr Lucas Skelton	Manager Horticulture
Mr David Edwards	Co-ordinator Arboriculture
Mr Jason Farrugia	Manager Strategic Procurement

Pass/Fail Assessment Criteria	Score
Quality Systems	<i>Pass/Fail</i>
OHS	<i>Pass/Fail</i>
Mandatory Insurances	<i>Pass/Fail</i>
Environmental Management	<i>Pass/Fail</i>

DISCUSSION

The following information supports the evaluation panel's recommendations.

Tender interviews were held with two key tenderers; Active Tree Services and TreeServe at the Manningham Civic Centre on 4 July. The collaborative group conducted an interview to confirm items of each submission including resourcing and capability to ensure all requirements can be met should they be successful.

PART A – Annual Cyclic Pruning

The final evaluation ranking (including the price and non-price evaluation criteria) had Active Tree Services ranked highest and as such, the evaluation panel recommends Active Tree Services as representing the best value outcome for Council.

PART B – Topiary & High Graft Pruning

The final evaluation ranking (including the price and non-price evaluation criteria) had TreeServe ranked highest and as such, the evaluation panel recommends TreeServe as representing the best value outcome for Council.

PART C1 – Tree Pruning – Electrical Line Clearance

For this category, the panel confirms that no more than two suppliers are required to satisfy Councils service needs. The final evaluation (including price and non-price evaluation criteria) ranked the following two suppliers the highest.

1. Active Tree Services
2. TreeServe

As such, the evaluation panel recommends these suppliers as representing the best value outcome for Council.

PART C2 – Tree Pruning – Reactive Works

For this category, the panel confirms that no more than two suppliers are required to satisfy Councils service needs. The final evaluation (including price and non-price evaluation criteria) ranked the following two suppliers the highest.

1. Active Tree Services
2. TreeServe

As such, the evaluation panel recommends these suppliers as representing the best value outcome for Council.

PART C3 – Live Line Clearance

For this category, the panel confirms that no more than two suppliers are required to satisfy Councils service needs. The final evaluation (including price and non-price evaluation criteria) ranked the following two suppliers the highest.

1. Active Tree Services
2. TreeServe

As such, the evaluation panel recommends these suppliers as representing the best value outcome for Council.

PART C4 – Tree Removal

The final evaluation ranking (including the price and non-price evaluation criteria) had TreeServe ranked highest and as such, the evaluation panel recommends TreeServe as representing the best value outcome for Council.

PART C5 – Stump Grinding

For this category, the panel confirms that no more than two suppliers are required to satisfy Councils service needs. The final evaluation (including price and non-price evaluation criteria) ranked the following two suppliers the highest.

1. Active Tree Services
2. TreeServe

As such, the evaluation panel recommends these suppliers as representing the best value outcome for Council.

PART C6 – Tree Root Barriers

The final evaluation ranking (including the price and non-price evaluation criteria) had Stumpmasters & Rootcontrollers ranked highest and as such, the evaluation panel recommends Stumpmasters & Rootcontrollers as representing the best value outcome for Council.

PART C7 – Data Collection

For this category, the panel confirms that no more than two suppliers are required to satisfy Councils service needs. The final evaluation (including price and non-price evaluation criteria) ranked the following two suppliers the highest.

1. Active Tree Services
2. Homewood Consulting Pty Ltd

As such, the evaluation panel recommends these suppliers as representing the best value outcome for Council.

PART D – Planting & Establishment

For this category, the panel confirms that no more than three suppliers are required to satisfy Councils service needs. The final evaluation (including price and non-price evaluation criteria) ranked the following three suppliers the highest.

1. Sevron
2. Metropolitan Tree Growers Pty Ltd
3. CityWide Pty Ltd

As such, the evaluation panel recommends these suppliers as representing the best value outcome for Council.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The financials associated for each part of contract are detailed in the table below.

The table provides a comparison between the estimated expenditure per annum based on the estimated annual volumes of work multiplied by the lowest value schedule of rate (Estimated Expenditure Per Annum) compared with the allocation of budgets within the 2019/20 operating and capital budgets to deliver the range of tree management services required to maintain councils tree population in a healthy and safe condition. The difference of \$88,836 provides the capacity deliver tree services outside the scope of this contract while also being able to accommodate increased work volumes throughout the year that may be caused by an extreme weather event.

Contract Part	Estimated Expenditure Per Annum (\$)	2019/20 Annual Budget
Part A - Cyclic Pruning Program	\$ 1,809,630	\$ 1,898,465
Part B - Topiary & High Graft Pruning (Mop Tops)	\$ 42,840	\$ 42,840
Part C1 - Pruning - Electrical Line Clearance	\$ 18,000	\$ 18,000
Part C2 - Tree Pruning Reactive Works	\$ 295,008	\$ 295,008
Part C3 - Pruning - Live Line Clearance	\$ 155,000	\$ 155,000
Part C4 - Tree Removal	\$ 729,770	\$ 729,770
Part C5 - Stump Grinding	\$ 8,663	\$ 8,664
Part C6 - Tree Root Barrier	\$ 7,200	\$ 7,200
Part C7 - Data Collection	\$ 825	\$ 825
Part D - Planting & Establishment	\$ 155,770	\$ 155,770
Totals	\$ 3,222,706	\$ 3,311,542

SUSTAINABILITY OUTCOMES

It was the Collaborative group's request that tenderers have in place or, be in the process of developing, a documented Environmental Management System in accordance with AS/NZS ISO 14001:2004.

Each tenderer has at least one of the following environmental / sustainability initiatives in place:-

- A. Best practices or programs in place to improve energy or water efficiency or reduce waste production or greenhouse gas emissions, e.g. green building design, green vehicles, carbon offsetting, large scale solar, waste avoidance projects
- B. Good practices or programs in place to improve energy or water efficiency or reduce waste production, e.g. organics / materials recycling, LED lights, water tanks

Each of the selected tenderers have passed the sustainability requirements of the tender.

CONCLUSION

That Council approves the recommendations contained within this report.